Reviewer’s report

Title: Who are the healthy active seniors? A cluster analysis

Version: 2  Date: 4 September 2014

Reviewer: Dannii Yeung

Reviewer’s report:

The manuscript has been improved by including other related concepts like healthy aging, successful aging and productive aging. There are, however, still a few issues that the authors should address in the next revision.

1. The objective of the study was not clearly spelled out in the introduction. Did this study aim to give a concrete conceptualization of active aging through comparing active and inactive seniors?

2. According to Rowe and Kahn (1997), successful aging is not solely focused on achieving better outcomes of physical and cognitive health, they also emphasize the importance of active engagement with life, including maintaining interpersonal relations and productive activity. Therefore, their definition of successful aging is indeed largely overlapped with your conceptualization of active aging (p.2). You may consider including Rowe and Kahn’s definition to strengthen the theoretical framework of and the predictions in this study.

3. More effort should be provided to inform the readers about the rationale of using the current research design (i.e., participants from an intervention program) to understand the concept of active aging.

4. The concern about the theoretical implication, which has been raised in my last review, is not adequately addressed. How do the current findings improve our conceptualization of active aging? Please provide more in-depth discussion on these issues, especially commenting on the similarities and differences between the current findings and those shown in the past literature on active aging.

Level of interest: An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: Yes, and I have assessed the statistics in my report.

Declaration of competing interests:

I met the first author in aging conferences but I don't have any competing interests with her.