Reviewer's report

**Title:** Pattern of Emergency Department Visits by Elderly patients: study from a Tertiary Care Hospital, Karachi

**Version:** 3 **Date:** 16 July 2013

**Reviewer:** Christian SWINE

**Reviewer's report:**

This is an interesting study analyzing the effects of case management on unplanned hospital admissions in very frail older adults with complex care needs. The study is well conducted in a finely prepared context as shown in the previous works of the group. The results disclose a positive effect, reducing the unplanned admissions and shifting unplanned admissions to planned admissions in the intervention group.

1) There are no major compulsory revisions
2) Minor essential revisions: english should be improved in some parts of the manuscript.
3) Disceretionary revisions: There are more than one essential component of the intervention in this study: the first is of course the dyad GP-case manager, but another is the RAI-HC assessment with the derived care planning. As shown in other studies, this process of care improves the outcomes. Moreover, in the current study, the same RAI-HC assessment was done in the control group, without the derived care planning. Since this is not really "usual care", this assessment might have in some extent reduced the differences observed, by improving some outcomes in the control group. Regarding the primary outcome "hospital admissions, the length of planned and unplanned hospital stay is not mentioned, and this might represent another effect of the intervention.

**Level of interest:** An article of importance in its field

**Quality of written English:** Acceptable

**Statistical review:** No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

**Declaration of competing interests:**

I declare that I have no competing interests