Author's response to reviews

Title: How effective are programs at managing transition from hospital to home? A case study of the Australian Transition Care Program

Authors:

Leonard C Gray (len.gray@uq.edu.au)
Nancye M Peel (n.peel@uq.edu.au)
Maria Crotty (Maria.Crotty@health.sa.gov.au)
Susan E Kurrle (skurrle@nsccahs.health.nsw.gov.au)
Lynne C Giles (lynne.giles@adelaide.edu.au)
Ian D Cameron (ian.cameron@sydney.edu.au)

Version: 4 Date: 17 February 2012

Author's response to reviews: see over
Dear Editor

RE: Revision of MS: 4433795624852352 submitted to BMC Geriatrics on 10 October 2011

Title: How effective are programs at managing transition from hospital to home? A case study of the Australian Transition Care Program

Authors: Leonard C. Gray, Nancye M. Peel, Maria Crotty, Susan E. Kurrle, Lynne C. Giles, Ian D. Cameron

The manuscript has been revised to address the reviewer’s comments. As requested a point-by-point response is as follows:

1) There is no information on how any of the analyses were done. Add either a footnote or a sentence on statistical modelling that was completed (i.e., Bivariate? Multivariate?). The placement I leave to the discretion of the Editor.

Authors’ Response
Footnotes a and b have been added to Table 1 to indicate analysis methods.

a indicates that results were based on multiple logistic regression analyses that adjusted for cognitive status, total number of ADL items for which help was needed, availability of a co-resident carer, and Charlson comorbidity index at initial hospital stay.
b indicates that results were based on Mann-Whitney U-tests

2) I request that findings from the logistic regression models have the p-values added to table 1 to explain the significance of the findings.

Authors’ Response
For the logistic regression models the authors would argue that confidence intervals are preferable to p-values, as they tell us the range of possible effect sizes as well as the direction, precision and strength of the demonstrated effect1. This enables conclusions to be drawn about the statistical plausibility and clinical relevance of the study findings. If the confidence interval does not include the value of zero effect, it can be assumed that there is a statistically significant result.

1 Rothman KJ, Greenland s, Lash TL. Modern Epidemiology 3rd Ed. Philadelphia PA: Lippincott, Williams & Wilkins; 2008

Changes made to Table 1 (pages 8-10) of the manuscript as a result of the above comments have been highlighted in yellow. We would welcome your early decision on the suitability of the article for publication in BMC Geriatrics.

Yours faithfully

Dr Nancye Peel