Reviewer's report

Title: Basic geriatric assessment does not predict in-hospital mortality after PEG placement

Version: 3 Date: 4 August 2012

Reviewer: Theodore Suh

Reviewer's report:

MAJOR ESSENTIAL REVISION:
None.

MINOR ESSENTIAL REVISIONS:

1. Regarding the limitations for the MMSE, I would also add that it generally is not used to detect the presence of delirium. Delirium is the type of cognitive impairment that is of particular concern in the acute care setting, since its presence is associated with a variety of poorer outcomes in the hospital. The CAM (Confusion Assessment Method) is most commonly used screening tool for detecting delirium. Unfortunately, the GEMIDAS does not include the CAM or other delirium screening tool, and this is a limitation of using the GEMIDAS.

2. It seems the term "geriatric assessment" may have different meaning in Germany, compared to the United States. The GEMIDAS database does not include an assessment of mood, information about polypharmacy or data on kidney function, all of which are generally a part of "basic geriatric assessment" in the United States. I suggest the authors change the title of their article to, "Use of the GEMIDAS database does not predict in-hospital mortality after PEG placement."

Level of interest: An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare I have no competing interests.