Reviewer's report

**Title:** Basic geriatric assessment does not predict in-hospital mortality after PEG placement

**Version:** 2 **Date:** 20 May 2012

**Reviewer:** Theodore Suh

**Reviewer's report:**

**MAJOR COMPULSORY REVISIONS**

1. There must be some mention of advanced directives, and how this may affect the selection of candidates for PEG tube placement.

2. "Miscellaneous" is a major category for the patients in this study, and is not helpful in characterizing the patients in this study. I'm surprised that cancer was not one of the major diagnoses considered among the baseline characteristics for this study. I would suggest that "Miscellaneous" be broken down into smaller categories.

3. Many of the patients in this study had a prior stroke. There is no mention of results of swallowing evaluations for this patients.

**MINOR ESSENTIAL REVISIONS**

1. "Pneumonia" was one of the major comorbidities. However, it is not clear what percentage of these cases were caused by aspiration.

2. "Depression" often contributes to decreased appetite, and is common in patients after a stroke. How common was "Depression" among the patients in this study?

3. More recent studies suggest that the MMSE is an inferior screening tool compared with the SLUMS or Montreal Cognitive Assessment (MOCA). In the Discussion, I think it is important to mention the use of the MMSE as a limitation for this study.

**DISCRETIONARY REVISIONS**

1. Medications can often be a contributing factor to decreased appetite and indirectly, poor nutritional status. How many of these patients were on 10 or more medications (i.e. how prevalent was polypharmacy)?

2. Chronic kidney disease can also be a contributing factor to decreased appetite and indirectly, poor nutritional status. How many of these patients had stage III or greater chronic kidney disease?

**Level of interest:** An article of importance in its field

**Quality of written English:** Acceptable
Statistical review: Yes, but I do not feel adequately qualified to assess the statistics.

Declaration of competing interests:
I do not have any competing interests, financial or otherwise, in regard to this manuscript.