Reviewer's report

Title: Basic geriatric assessment does not predict in-hospital mortality after PEG placement

Version: 2 Date: 17 April 2012

Reviewer: David Sanders

Reviewer's report:

This is a large retrospective database study of PEG insertion and outcomes. The investigators have made some novel observations about cognitive status prior to insertion.

I would like to make a few suggestions

1. Reference 8 is incomplete – could this be expanded accordingly
   Percutaneous endoscopic gastrostomy: 30-day mortality trends and risk factors.

2. The authors discuss issues regarding dementia and gastrostomy insertion but have not mentioned 2 key papers. Could these be cited and discussed for a more comprehensive picture.
   The clinical course of advanced dementia.
   Mitchell SL, Teno JM, Kiely DK, Shaffer ML, Jones RN, Prigerson HG, Volicer L, Givens JL, Hamel MB.

3. I think in the introduction the authors have not provided a full list of previously recognised factors which may be associated with a worse PEG outcome. To this effect I have enclosed a review article and recent paper which provide relevant references that should be mentioned (for example, CRP and swallowing abnormality). Equally he authors did not collect this information and this has to be mentioned as a limitation in the discussion.

4. The authors need to clarify miscellaneous. I am concerned that suggesting that this category has a risk factor does not help the clinician as we don’t know what that means – could they expand

5. Where do common PEG groups like head injury, Road Traffic accident or horse injury (with cerebral damage), Motor Neurone Disease or Multiple Sclerosis sit in their classification. The grouping does not lend itself to an understanding of risk within different sub-groups. Please could they expand and I think provide a new classification for their study.
Level of interest: An article of importance in its field

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: Yes, and I have assessed the statistics in my report.

Declaration of competing interests:

Nothing to declare