Reviewer's report

Title: Informant-Reported Cognitive Symptoms That Predict Amnestic Mild Cognitive Impairment

Version: 3 Date: 15 July 2011

Reviewer: Eleni Aretouli

Reviewer's report:

In this revision the authors have considerably improved their manuscript and have addressed most of the issues I raised. In general, it is a well-written paper on a very interesting and timely topic, as I mentioned also in my previous review.

Major point:
However, I still have some concerns regarding the interpretations of the results obtained in this study. I feel that the authors overstate the importance and clinical/diagnostic utility of their results from the regression analysis when they claim that “certain AQ items can differentiate individuals with aMCI from those experiencing age-associated changes in memory and cognition.” There is no question that there is an association of the four items and the group membership of the participants (cognitively normal or aMCI). However, the results of the regression analysis do not provide convincing evidence that these four items should be used diagnostically or as screening measures. The odds ratios in Table 3 are large, but, as the authors correctly acknowledge the CIs are very broad. In any case, there is no compelling evidence why someone should choose this questionnaire (and the specific four items) over the numerous brief questionnaires or measures that already exist.

Minor points:
1. It would be useful to include in Table 3 how much variance is accounted for by the four items.
2. The first two sentences of the Intro imply that MCI represents a dementing process. Though individuals with MCI are at higher risk for dementia, MCI is a clinical syndrome with multiple etiologies and outcomes that range from normal cognitive aging to dementia, so it does not always represent a dementing process.

Level of interest: An article of importance in its field

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.
Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests"