Reviewer’s report

**Title:** Determining the Impact of Medical Co-morbidity on Subjective and Objective Cognitive Performance in an Inner City Memory Disorders Clinic: A Retrospective Chart Review

**Version:** 1  **Date:** 9 September 2010

**Reviewer:** Klaus P. Ebmeier

**Reviewer’s report:**

This an interesting report that needs a certain amount of attention:

The introduction should be shortened substantially and maybe organised to lead up to the hypotheses, tightly documenting every prediction made.

The sample needs to be defined in terms of diagnoses, medication, other relevant clinical factors to be interpretable. (The paragraph: "The present study was conducted in a Memory Disorders Clinic located in a large urban centre..." may fit better in the results or even methods section?)

"Our clinic is located in an Inner City neighbourhood where patients typically have low SES" - how does that make it suitable to examine the effects of SES?

In the methods section the difficulties associated with multiple comparisons and confounding, and the solutions of these problems employed in this study should be described.

The discussion should provide a systematic description of study limitations due to cross-sectional design, clinical rather than epidemiological sample, subject number etc... The self-selection to attend a memory clinic may have played a role in the correlations observed? General applicability of the results to the population, different patient groups should be discussed.

How was depression defined?

Define the abbreviation SES before using it (does it include education? [Abstract]).

How does "residential SES" differ from personal SES, as employed in other studies in its effects on cognition and why?

... the CIRS score correlated positively with the MMSE score... are you sure?

**Level of interest:** An article of limited interest

**Quality of written English:** Acceptable

**Statistical review:** No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a
statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:

'I declare that I have no competing interests'