Reviewer's report

Title: Comparison of hemodynamic and nutritional parameters between older persons practitioner of physical activity nonsmokers and ex-smokers: a prospective study.

Version: 2 Date: 31 March 2010

Reviewer: Catherine Chambliss

Reviewer's report:

This is an interesting paper.

Last sentence of abstract and end of conclusion section are not supported by your data. From my reading these findings suggest that exercise may be more beneficial to HR among those without a history of smoking, while more useful in affected VO2 for former smokers after one year.

There are some language/typo problems that need to be corrected (t-test, not T-test...nutricional...)

In the intragroup analysis, this study verified a significant increase in VO2 for the Ex-smoker Group after one year of activities in the program. The Nonsmoker Group did not show the same behavior (change last word...VO2 is not a behavior)

Serious Lang problems in the method section:

Was considered a regular physical exercise those practiced for tree times a week.

To select elderly individuals practitioner of regular physical exercise a convenience sample was selected among the participants of the Adult Revitalization Program. This program is maintained by UFSCar in partnership with the Municipality of São Carlos and seeks to implement the assistance to the elderly, through the maintenance of physical ability, socialization and quality of life. The physical exercise session of the Revitalization Program were held three times a week, with a duration of 55 minutes, in groups from 20 to 30 elderly people. The sessions are given by physical educators and include stretching practice, aerobic
conditioning, muscle strength training, coordination activities, balance, respiratory and
relaxation exercises.
Those who attended less than 75% of the program sessions, which did not participated
of the program for 12 consecutive months and not appeared in the four annual evaluations
were excluded. The elderly who meets the criteria were selected (n=40) and divided into two
groups paired by age, with reference to their smoking history (Nonsmoker Group and Exsmoker
Group), with 20 individuals in each group

**Level of interest:** An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

**Quality of written English:** Needs some language corrections before being published

**Statistical review:** No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

**Declaration of competing interests:**
'I declare that I have no competing interests'