Reviewer's report

Title: Dietary patterns associated with fall related fracture in elderly Japanese: a population based prospective study

Version: 3 Date: 19 January 2010

Reviewer: Amanda Devine

Reviewer's report:

This is a rereview of the paper Dietary patterns associated with fall related fracture in elderly Japanese: a population based prospective study authored by Monama et al.

The authors have addressed, in part, the reviewers comments by underlined additions to the manuscript. Most of these seem appropriate, however, they have not been fully addressed in a letter of response to the author.

The authors have emphasised the division of the sample into tertiles and tabulated the nutrient intake for the different dietary for patterns in Table 4. The text in the Results section that refers to this should be reworded to:

Nutrient intakes were not different between the tertiles for the Vegetable or Meat Patterns. In the Traditional Japanese pattern, nutrient intake was significantly different for total and animal protein, vitamin B1, C, Calcium, magnesium and phosphate (Table 4).

Can the authors make further comment on these data in the discussion as the nutrient intake across patterns does not differ. Can the authors give some explanation as to what components in the food or the mechanism of action that may be responsible for negative effect associated with some vegetables and the protective effect of other vegetables. There needs to be some discussion about the proposed mechanism of action for the protective effect of meat intake albeit at a lower level than other countries.

Minor essential revisions

1. Authors need to explain the term experience Smoking
2. p.5 line 5. Reword: Fracture data was available on all 877 participants including 39 subject who had died in the follow-up period. All clinical records of patients who fractured were reviewed by physician (R.N.)
3. Remove the word ‘etc’. p. 6, 3rd line from the bottom.
4. Define stabilizers
5. p.7 .3rd line from the bottom: Typographical error. In text Rice (HR=0.54, 95%CI 0.36-0.96) differs from that presented in Table 6.
6. p.8, line 5 use correct symbol #
7. p.8, line 15, no need to capitalise the word NOT
8. p.8, line 10 remove the initial T from reference
9. Table 4 Traditional Japanese pattern correct T3(moderately confirmed) to read T2.

**Level of interest:** An article of importance in its field

**Quality of written English:** Needs some language corrections before being published

**Statistical review:** No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

**Declaration of competing interests:**
'I declare that I have no competing interests