Reviewer's report

Title: Plasma disappearance rate of Indocyanine green is a prognostic indicator in acute liver failure

Version: 1 Date: 6 September 2009

Reviewer: William Bernal

Reviewer's report:

Major Compulsory Revisions

The study is by necessity limited by its small size and by the number of non-transplanted deaths. One cannot assume that all those transplanted would have died as survival in this group may be >15% and consequently test performance may be inferior to that stated. This should be emphasised in the text and statistics for test performance should also state the 95% confidence intervals.

The authors should also consult the STARD initiative (http://www.stard-statement.org/) to formalise their report as with a few minor changes and supplemental data it could conform to this important programme.

Discussion

I think reference 16 is the wrong one and should be -

Fulminant hepatic failure secondary to acetaminophen poisoning: a systematic review and meta-analysis of prognostic criteria determining the need for liver transplantation

Bailey, B. et al
Critical Care Medicine 2003 31(1);299-305

Assessing the performance of the Kings College Criteria in this study is impossible as if it was the means by which transplant candidates were selected. This should be stated in text.

- Minor Essential Revisions

Introduction

‘It does not represent liver blood flow.’ Surely ‘It does not represent liver blood flow alone’ would be more accurate.

Results

‘The only clear correlation obtained was between ICG-PDR and meld score..’ This is imprecise language and a little surprising. Given the strong correlation
with MELD it’s odd that there was no correlation with any of its component variables. These data should be presented. How did ICG-PDR correlate with blood lactate?

**Level of interest:** An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

**Quality of written English:** Acceptable

**Statistical review:** No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

**Declaration of competing interests:**

I declare I have no competing interests.