Reviewer's report

Title: Child-Pugh score is superior to model for end-stage liver disease score (MELD) in predicting survival on and need for removal from waiting list in patients awaiting liver transplantation

Version: 1 Date: 9 May 2009

Reviewer: Teh-Ia Huo

Reviewer's report:

The authors investigated the predictive accuracy for the outcome between the CTP and MELD system. They concluded that CTP is superior to the MELD for outcome prediction. There have been abundant studies in this regard during the past 6-7 years. This study does not provide new or novel information.

The MELD has been chosen by the UNOS since 2002 in the US as the major reference system for organ allocation in liver transplantation. The authors provided data to argue against this strategy. However, the case number in this study was relatively small (n=268). More importantly, the authors did not report the AUC values for CTP and MELD, and the p value for the statistical difference (Fig. 2), which I suppose there is no statistical difference between CTP and MELD. Therefore, their findings do not justify the conclusion.

Level of interest: An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

Quality of written English: Needs some language corrections before being published

Statistical review: Yes, and I have assessed the statistics in my report.

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests.