Reviewer’s report

Title: Interrelationship between TP53 gene deletion, protein expression and chromosome 17 aneusomy in gastric adenocarcinoma

Version: 1 Date: 7 April 2009

Reviewer: Tamotsu Sugai

Reviewer’s report:

The author indicates that there are chr17 and TP53 copy number alterations in gastric cancers. Although this manuscript is generally well written, several points regarding the work are listed below:

1. The author analyzed 20 intestinal- and diffuse-type gastric cancers for chromosome 17p and TP53 copy number alterations. However, the number of tumor samples examined is too small to determine the role of 17p and TP53 copy number alterations in gastric carcinogenesis. To examine the role of 17p and TP53 copy number alterations in gastric carcinogenesis, the author should increase the number of tumor samples.

2. Although the manuscript has some novel findings, in its present form the author has not provided new findings about gastric carcinogenesis.

3. The author suggests that deletion of TP53 and chromosome 17 aneusomy are common events in gastric cancer and that p53 mutation may be implicated in the distinct carcinogenic process of diffuse- and intestinal-type cancers. However, contrasting data were given. The author should discuss in the text the roles of TP53 deletion, chromosome 17 aneusomy, and p53 mutation with regard to intestinal- and diffuse-type cancers.

4. This study could not clarify the role of the above-mentioned alterations in the early development of gastric cancers. The author should discuss this point in the text.

5. In the Materials and Methods section the author should describe in detail the FISH method that was used.

Level of interest: An article of limited interest

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests' below.