Reviewer’s report

Title: Interrelationship between TP53 gene deletion, protein expression and chromosome 17 aneusomy in gastric adenocarcinoma

Version: 1 Date: 11 February 2009

Reviewer: Haruhiko Sugimura

Reviewer's report:

This is a small scale, confirmative work. The data is concise and easily understand.

Many LOH papers adopt the famous Knudson's scheme having two chromosomal status changed into single allele deletion in retinoblastoma. Actually, as the authors and the others believe, many tumors has 3 and more chromosomes in each. One question may be raised about expression level and polysomy pattern. How about relative loss (like in the table of Kobayashi M paper(ref20)) in terms to expression level?

1. Figures are clear, but you have to show intestinal and diffuse type representative cases2. with p53 immunostaining and FISH.

2. In diffuse type, definite LOH (not relative one) of p53 seems to be rampant, which is consistent with the early stage diffuse type cancer often near diploid (cite hereditary diffuse gastric cancer dormant stage), thus the inconsistency with ref 23 would not be necessarily due to geographical difference, but to difference in stage when observation was done.

3. Percentage of normal karyotype in tumors are high. Is it consistent with clonal expansion of tumor cells with abnormal chromosomal status?

Level of interest: An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests.