Reviewer's report

Title: Meta-analysis of Percutaneous Radiofrequency Ablation versus Ethanol Injection in Hepatocellular Carcinoma.

Version: 1 Date: 19 January 2009

Reviewer: Kazutaka Kurokohchi

Reviewer's report:

Review RE: Meta-analysis of percutaneous radiofrequency ablation versus ethanol injection in hepatocellular carcinoma by Bouza et. al.

The authors analyzed systemic reviews and meta-analyses of randomized control trials of hepatocellular carcinoma treated with RFA and PEI and concluded that RFA is superior to PEI in terms of better survival and local control of disease. However, the higher rates of adverse events are displayed in the RFA treatment.

Analyzed systematic reviews are appropriately selected. Both of method for analysis and analyzed item focused on are also appropriate. Therefore, this manuscript should be finally published in the BMC Gastroenterology.

Although it is mentioned in the manuscript regarding the adverse effects of RFA and PEI, those effects on the hepatic capacity are not mentioned. As everyone knows, RFA treatment sometimes affects hepatic capacity of cirrhotic liver leading to decrease of the level of albumin and administration of amino acids is helpful to prevent the decrease of albumin level. Thus, it is likely to be better to address regarding the effect of RFA on the hepatic capacity somewhere in the manuscript.

Level of interest: An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests.