Reviewer's report

Title: Selenoprotein S (SEPS1) gene -105G>A promoter polymorphism influences the susceptibility of Japanese to gastric cancer

Version: 2 Date: 25 September 2008

Reviewer: Bing Xia

Reviewer's report:

1. Is the question posed by the authors well defined?
   Yes, well defined.

2. Are the methods appropriate and well described?
   Yes,

3. Are the data sound?
   a little big

4. Does the manuscript adhere to the relevant standards for reporting and data deposition?
   yes,

5. Are the discussion and conclusions well balanced and adequately supported by the data?
   yes,

6. Are limitations of the work clearly stated?
   no

7. Do the authors clearly acknowledge any work upon which they are building, both published and unpublished?
   yes

8. Do the title and abstract accurately convey what has been found?
   yes

9. Is the writing acceptable?
   Yes, acceptable

Comments:
The manuscript written by Dr. Tomoyuki Shibata et al entitled selenoprotein S (SEPS1) gene -105G>A promoter polymorphism influences the susceptibility of Japanese to gastric cancer is very interesting. The authors found that the A allele of SEPS1 -105G>A promoter polymorphism was associated with intestinal type
of gastric cancer and gastric cancer located in middle third part in Japanese population. However, there are several questions raised for the manuscript:

1. Since a border significance for the association of SEPS1 -105G>A promoter polymorphism with gastric cancer, how to prevent bias for this small significance, at least has to mention in discussion part.

2. H. pylori infection was determined only by one positive of microscopic examination, urea breath test or serum anti-H pylori antibody titer. Disparity of the methods may also exist for the explanation. So at least two methods used to define Hp infection could be better than one method.

3. The control groups are not well defined.

I suggest to revise the manuscript.