Reviewer’s report

Title: Etiology of liver cirrhosis does not influence the severity of hepatic encephalopathy: a cross-sectional study

Version: 1 Date: 22 August 2008

Reviewer: Giovanni Tarantino

Reviewer’s report:

1. Is the question posed by the authors well defined? YES
2. Are the methods appropriate YES and well described? See below
3. Are the data sound? YES
4. Does the manuscript adhere to the relevant standards for reporting and data deposition? YES
5. Are the discussion and conclusions well balanced and adequately supported by the data? YES
6. Are limitations of the work clearly stated? YES
7. Do the authors clearly acknowledge any work upon which they are building, both published and unpublished? YES

Minor Essential Revisions

The Authors are advised:

1) To change the term “severity” with the term “presence/prevalence” in the title.
2) To start with a general sentence such as “There are scarce and conflicting data on which type of liver cirrhosis could more frequently induce HE” in the Background of the Abstract.
3) To eliminate the sentence “diabetes mellitus has been .........hepatic encephalopathy” in the Background of the Abstract
4) To put forward the last sentence of the Conclusion in the Abstract “Cirrhosis etiology.....” and afterward the first one “Cognitive impairment.......”
5) To change “sort” in “short” at page 7 in “Assessment of health........of life” of Methods.
6) To change “more” in “less” at page 10 in “HE in alcoholic vs cholestasis” of Results.

- Discretionary Revisions

1) To add, please, in exclusion criteria, when dealing with the patients’ selection, why cryptogenic cirrhotic patients were excluded. This is the reason for which so few NASH patients were enrolled.
Anyway, the NASH patients were not taken in consideration also because there would be a statistical interference due to the presence of insulin resistance.

**Level of interest:** An article of importance in its field

**Quality of written English:** Acceptable

**Statistical review:** No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

**Declaration of competing interests:**

I declare that I have no competing interests.