Reviewer's report

Title: Colonic epithelial ion transport is not affected in patients with diverticulosis

Version: 3 Date: 19 July 2007

Reviewer: James M Mullin

Reviewer's report:

General
The authors have done a good job of responding to comments and modifying where appropriate. I congratulate them on their work. There are two points that they still may want to further clarify.

Major Comments
I think that the clarification on page 4 needs to be made more clearly that the biopsies were taken in normal appearing mucosa, not from the diverticuli per se. This needs to be said exactly. In addition, is there evidence that any cellular/molecular abnormalities associated with diverticuli would extend to normal appearing tissue?

Minor Comments
I would still give the reader a fuller explanation of why changes in SCC necessarily lead to changes in G. Does this mean that transcellular G is necessarily increased when SCC increases? If this is true, state this in the manuscript. Many readers would not make the connection.

-----------------------------------------

Major Compulsory Revisions (that the author must respond to before a decision on publication can be reached)

-----------------------------------------

Minor Essential Revisions (such as missing labels on figures, or the wrong use of a term, which the author can be trusted to correct)

-----------------------------------------

Discretionary Revisions (which the author can choose to ignore)

What next?: Accept after discretionary revisions

Level of interest: An article of outstanding merit and interest in its field
Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: Yes, and I have assessed the statistics in my report.

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests

JM Mullin