Reviewer's report

Title: Efficacy of Rifabutin-based Triple Therapy as Second-line to Eradicate Helicobacter Pylori Infection

Version: 1 Date: 10 February 2007

Reviewer: Giovanni Cammarota

Reviewer's report:

General: The present study is the first clinical trial designed to compare, as a second-line treatment, a rifabutin-based regimen with standard quadruple therapy. The study is well designed and conducted. The relevant literature is sufficiently reflected in the paper. Although the study provides negative results, I think it should be published. Rifabutin is used as a salvage treatment against mycobacterium tuberculosis and as prophylactic against the mycobacterium avium infection in HIV-positive patients. It should be used, therefore, with prudence in order to avoid an increasing of resistance to this drug.

-------------------------------------------------------------------------------

Major Compulsory Revisions (that the author must respond to before a decision on publication can be reached): None.

-------------------------------------------------------------------------------

Minor Essential Revisions (such as missing labels on figures, or the wrong use of a term, which the author can be trusted to correct):

In the Discussion session, it should be mentioned that different geographical areas may reflect the different results obtained by other study. For example, another study conducted in Spain (Gisbert JP et al Aliment Pharmacol Ther 2006;24(10):1469-74) achieved similar negative findings by using a third-line savage package containing a rifabutin-based triple regimen (the study should be cited).

The English should be revised.

-------------------------------------------------------------------------------

Discretionary Revisions (which the author can choose to ignore)

What next?: Accept after minor essential revisions

Level of interest: An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

Quality of written English: Needs some language corrections before being published

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests.