Reviewer's report

Title: Autoimmune hepatitis in India: is it uncommon or underdiagnosed

Version: 2 Date: 8 February 2005

Reviewer: Shiv K Sarin

Reviewer's report:

Comments

Autoimmune Hepatitis in India

The study by Choudhary et al is related to Autoimmune Hepatitis In India. They have suggested that this disease is rather uncommon and presents late in the Indian context. There are several major concerns with this study:

Comments:

1. It is not clear, which components of the criteria of the International Autoimmune Hepatitis Group were present in the 30 patients with definite AIH and 8 patients with probable AIH. These have not been specified at all.

2. Only one patient was positive for AMA, however PBC was diagnosed in three patients. How?

3. In patients with chronic presentation and not undergoing liver biopsy, how was the presence of cirrhosis excluded?

4. In three patients without antibody positivity, what diagnostic criteria were fulfilled. What were their liver histology findings and were they definite AIH or probable AIH based on the international criteria.

5. No mention has been made of the dilutions of ANA, ASMA, etc. in the results.

6. The results are very casually written. The treatment options regimens, the inclusion and exclusion criteria, end-point of therapy and treatment response have not been defined.

7. Discussion is quite speculative and is a repetition of results. It is mentioned in the first Para that there is low prevalence of AIH due to genetic or geographic reasons. No basis has been given.

8. Overall, there is nothing new in this study. There are already published recent and large Indian studies and authors have not found much difference in their study as compared to previous Indian studies.