Reviewer's report

Title: Hepatocellular carcinoma and the penetrance of HFE C282Y mutations: a cross sectional study.

Version: 1 Date: 8 March 2005

Reviewer: Mark Worwood

Reviewer's report:

General
Willis et al

This paper is an extension of earlier studies involving fewer patients from Norwich. The analysis of 144 cases allows a much close estimate of penetrance.

----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------

Major Compulsory Revisions (that the author must respond to before a decision on publication can be reached)

None

----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------

Minor Essential Revisions (such as missing labels on figures, or the wrong use of a term, which the author can be trusted to correct)

Detailed comments

1. Page 4, para 2, line 5: I am surprised that the authors are not quoting their work on arthritis at this point.

2. Page 5, para 2: presumably any patients referred from Norwich to Cambridge have not been counted twice (later section of text implies this).

3. Page 5, para 4: is there a reference to the method for extracting DNA from tissue sections?

4. Page 19, Table 1: is there any reason for the discrepancy in forward and reverse primer concentrations?

----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------

Discretionary Revisions (which the author can choose to ignore)

None

What next?: Accept after minor essential revisions

Level of interest: An article of importance in its field
Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests.