Reviewer's report

Title: A comparison of Child-Pugh, APACHE II and APACHE III scoring systems in predicting hospital mortality of patients with liver cirrhosis

Authors:

Constantinos Chatzicostas (matrix01gr@yahoo.gr)
Dr Maria Roussomoustakaki (mrousso1@hotmail.com)
Georgios Notas (chief@med.uoc.gr)
Ioannis G Vlachonikolis (i.vlachonikolis@surrey.ac.uk)
Demetrios Samonakis (photein@in.gr)
John Romanos (romanos@med.uoc.gr)
Emmanouel Vardas (evardas@hotmail.com)
Prof Elias A Kouroumalis (kouroum@med.uoc.gr)

Version: 3  Date: 17 Mar 2003
Reviewer: Markus Wehler

Level of interest: A paper whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

Advice on publication: Accept after discretionary revisions

The questions of the reviewers were answered point by point. The proposed goodness of fit statistic changed the results of the manuscript completely. The methods are appropriate and well described, results adhere to the relevant standards for reporting and data deposition. The discussion points out the major problems associated with such research and the conclusions apply to the reported data.

Discretionary revisions:
1. The title should indicate that ward patients and not critically ill patients were investigated.
2. The expression "strata of increasing predicting mortality" (page 2, last para, and page 12) is difficult to understand and should be rephrased.

Competing interests:

None declared.