Reviewer's report

Title: NOX2-generated oxidative stress is associated with severity of ultrasound liver steatosis in patients with non-alcoholic fatty liver disease

Version: 3
Date: 28 November 2013
Reviewer: Amedeo Lonardo

Reviewer's report:


2. The Authors may be willing to discuss that, at variance with other more recent and validated indices (Ballestri S, et al Liver Int. 2012;32:1242-52.), the ultrasonographic Hamaguchi score does not specifically predict NASH.

3. The Authors need to be more prudent: Statistical association between US evidence compatible with steatosis and markers of increased oxidative stress does not imply causality. Moreover, the two quoted studies (Pacana T, Curr Opin Clin Nutr Metab Care 2012,15:641–648. and Sanyal AJ, New Engl J Med 2010,362:1675–1685.) are not guidelines. Finally, based on comparative analysis, the statement that guidelines support antioxidant treatment should be deleted (Nascimbeni F, J Hepatol. 2013;59:859-71.).

4. This submission states that “Liver steatosis was defined according to Hamaguchi criteria based on the presence of abnormally intense, high level echoes arising from the hepatic parenchyma, liver-kidney difference in echo amplitude, echo penetration into deep portion of the liver and clarity of liver blood vessel structure [32-33].” Accordingly, reference 32 needs to be deleted.

5. The statement “......ultrasound, which is a qualitative method inadequate to quantify less than 30% liver fat content [36].” conflicts with more recent studies (Dasarathy S, J Hepatol. 2009;51:1061-7).

Level of interest: An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

Quality of written English: Acceptable
Statistical review: Yes, but I do not feel adequately qualified to assess the statistics.

Declaration of competing interests:
'I declare that I have no competing interests'