Reviewer’s report

Title: Hepatobiliary cystadenocarcinoma without mesenchymal stroma in a female patient: a case report

Version: Date: 7 March 2014

Reviewer: omar shah

Reviewer's report:

Major compulsory
The differentiation of biliary cystadenocarcinomas from IMPN-B and intrahepatic cholangiocarcinoma is a pathologist’s nightmare, with many pathologists reluctant for giving a diagnosis of cystadenocarcinoma when OS is missing;

a) Did you use any IHC staining for mucins and ck-7/20.

b) How many samples of the specimen were analysed, as in some patients OS may be focally present.

The article needs more CT pictographs with vivid delineation of the lesion and the surrounding liver architecture and a IHC picture if done.

The USG picture quality is not so good.
Some intrao-operative photographs and the pictures when grossing the specimen would be more than handful.

Minor Essential Revision
Your article has some grammatical corrections amidst the colloquialism of language.

The exclusivity of ovarian stroma and female sex as regarding cystadenocarcinomas is not a rule thou much more common.(Bardin et al, 2004).

Level of interest: An article of importance in its field

Quality of written English: Needs some language corrections before being published

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.