Reviewer's report

Title: High mortality of pneumonia in cirrhotic patients with ascites

Version: 2 Date: 27 December 2012

Reviewer: Tony Bruns

Reviewer's report:

In their revision, the authors clarify some important points raised and improved the value of the manuscript (Points 1a, 1b).

In their point-to-point responses, the authors acknowledge that the following data are important to interpret the results and confounders: MELD score, causes of death, type of pneumonia (CAP, HAP, VAP), presence of SIRS, ICU-treatment, pneumonia severity scores (Points 2a-d). However, their method of data acquisition (retrospective ICD-based study) does not allow to incorporate these data.

Furthermore, microbiological data are not available and, therefore, recommendations regarding prophylaxis (vaccination) or empiric treatment cannot be drawn.

Major Compulsory Revisions

1) English grammar is poor throughout the manuscript. I would advice a professional language editing service prior to publication.

2) Please indicate the limitations of the study (see Points 2a-d and above) in the manuscript.

Level of interest: An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

Quality of written English: Needs some language corrections before being published

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests