Reviewer's report

Title: A case of rectal tumor in which the shape altered with regression in short period

Version: 1 Date: 26 June 2013

Reviewer: Charles LeVea

Reviewer's report:

The paper describes a 10 mm well differentiated adenocarcinoma that "spontaneously" regressed after biopsy to a 1 mm lesion. An endoscopic submucosal resection with a ligation device was performed a month after diagnosis to resect the tumor from an area that the endoscopist had difficulty identifying as tumor. This may have been from the same area as the initial biopsy; however, tattoo ink was not used at the time of initial biopsy to mark the site of the tumor. From the submitted photomicrographs, this resection specimen contained submucosal fibrosis, intramucosal hemorrhage, and a single gland with high grade glandular dysplasia. I could not identify residual adenocarcinoma in the photos in the submitted figure. Additionally, the initial biopsy that carried a diagnosis of a well differentiated adenocarcinoma was not submitted as a figure. Therefore, this case report is based on an unconfirmed diagnosis of adenocarcinoma. Without an ability to confirm that an adenocarcinoma was present, this case report should not be accepted for publication. Please see Major Compulsory Revisions below.

Major Compulsory Revisions

1. Figure of the initial biopsy specimen clearly showing an adenocarcinoma
2. Diagnosis for Figure 6 - high grade glandular dysplasia - not invasive adenocarcinoma or show picture proving invasion

Minor Essential Revision

"further" is misspelled page 5 line 3

Level of interest: An article of limited interest

Quality of written English: Needs some language corrections before being published

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:

No competing interests to declare.