Reviewer's report

Title: Applicability of a short/rapid 13C-urea breath test for Helicobacter pylori: a retrospective multicenter chart review study

Version: 4 Date: 9 January 2012

Reviewer: Michael Fried

Reviewer's report:

I have reviewed the manuscript and would recommend to accept it for publication in BMC Gastroenterology. I do not share the concerns of reviewer 2: The comparison of this relatively new technology to standard infrared spectrometry have already been performed and published. Furthermore it is not the goal of the study to validate BreathID for the detection of HP infection but to explore if this test would diminish the length of the measurement period. The authors convincingly demonstrate that BreathID, probably by providing continuous 13C data can distinctly shorten the measurement time to detect HP in patients. The authors acknowledge that the high dose of citric acid may have also played a role to achieve this effect. The findings are important and though this is an retrospective and not comparative study relevant.