Reviewer's report

Title: Role of Vitamin K2 in Preventing the Recurrence of Hepatocellular Carcinoma after Curative Treatment. A Meta-Analysis of Randomized Controlled Trials.

Version: 1 Date: 3 July 2012

Reviewer: Masataka MS Seike

Reviewer's report:

In this article, the author summarized previous 5 RCTs that examined the effect of vitamin K2 in preventing the recurrence of HCC using meta-analysis. The author concluded that the efficacy of vitamin K2 in suppressing HCC recurrence at 1 year was not confirmed in this meta-analysis.

Major compulsory revision

1. The largest and most recent trial by Yoshida and colleagues was performed as a clinical trial (multicenter, placebo-controlled, double-blind trial enrolling 548 patients) to judge the preventive effect of vitamin K2 on HCC recurrence because the previous results reported by Mizuta, Kakizaki and Hotta had been inconsistent. So it is not appropriate to discuss these four manuscripts as same category. In Japan, a consensus has been reached about no efficacy of vitamin K2 in suppressing HCC recurrence after the clinical trial. Therefore we don’t think this meta-analysis leads to a new knowledge in this field.

Minor essential revisions

1. Figure 1 is missing
2. In the Results, 11th paragraph, 4th line, 95% CI: 0.28-0.128 is a typographical error, which should be read as 0.28-1.28.
3. Table 2, Mizuka is a typographical error for Mizuta.
4. Reference 1, the details of the journal are missing.

Level of interest: An article of limited interest

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests.