Reviewer's report

Title: Modified endoscopic submucosal dissection with enucleation for treatment of gastric subepithelial tumors originating from the muscularis propria layer

Version: 1 Date: 4 June 2012

Reviewer: Arjun Koch

Reviewer's report:

Major points

1. My major concern is to whether there was a correct indication for ESD in the cases described to begin with. Our current guidelines state that lesions over 3 cm should be resected. Only 3 lesions in this series were greater than 3 cm of which one could not be resected endoscopically! Furthermore all lesions proved to be of a low malignant potential so there was little need for resection. The authors should explain why they felt that resection was indicated.

2. The authors demonstrate an ESD technique with enucleation for the treatment of gastric subepithelial tumors originating from the proper muscle layer. Similar reports have been published recently and should be referenced. (e.g. “Bing-Rong Liu et al, Endoscopic muscularis dissection for upper gastrointestinal subepithelial tumors originating from the muscularis propria.” Surg Endosc April 2012)

3. p5. "Expectant management with life-long endoscopic screening causes tremendous economic and emotional burden for these patients"... Were is the evidence for this statement? Even though this statement seems to be used to justify resection, a periodic endoscopic follow-up of patients is advised on page 12...

4. There is no concrete description about the usefulness of the modified ESD technique. The usefulness of modified ESD should be explained more.

5. Although the main theme is ESD for gastric subepithelial tumors originating from the muscularis propria layer, there is no explanation of Leiomyoma except GIST in discussion.

Minor points

1. There is no product name of an electrosurgical snare which used to shorten the procedure time.

2. There is no description about the settings of the HF electric devices.

Level of interest: An article of limited interest

Quality of written English: Needs some language corrections before being published
**Statistical review:** No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

**Declaration of competing interests:**

I declare that I have no competing interests