Reviewer’s report

Title: Caustic ingestion in adults: The role of age in predicting outcome

Version: 1 Date: 23 February 2011

Reviewer: Rakesh Kochhar

Reviewer’s report:

Major Compulsory Revisions

Cheng et al in this study have analysed the outcome of patients with caustic ingestion based on age, less than and more than 65 years. They have concluded that elderly patients had more systemic complications and poorer outcome than younger patients.

Material and methods: Definitions of systemic and GI complications should be given in this section.

Results

1. The authors have straight away gone on to give analysis of their data. They need to first give the detailed results, the spectrum of injury and the way the patients were managed. What were the complications, what were the infections and how were they managed etc.

2. Causes of mortality should be added.

3. HOW LONG WERE THE PATIENTS FOLLOWED UP?

4 What were the comorbidities in the 2 groups?

Discussion

IN this section the authors should discuss the results primarily with differences in the 2 groups giving explanation for their findings. For example they need to discuss the importance of endoscopic grading in the 2 groups. Similarly they should discuss wheather it just the pre existing co morbidity which affects the outcome. And are the systemic complications due to only their elderly age. Or is it the hospitalisation that is responsible for the negative outcome.

Level of interest: An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

Quality of written English: Needs some language corrections before being published

Statistical review: Yes, but I do not feel adequately qualified to assess the statistics.

Declaration of competing interests:
'I declare that I have no competing interests'