Reviewer's report

Title: Clinicopathologic characteristics and treatment outcomes of hepatoid adenocarcinoma of stomach, a rare but unique subtype of gastric cancer

Version: 3 Date: 31 March 2011

Reviewer: John H Kalbfleisch

Reviewer's report:

These comments follow a request for statistical review.

Major Compulsory Revisions – none.

Minor Essential Revisions – none.

Discretionary Revisions

(1) Figures 2 and 3. The vertical upticks (5 in Fig 2, 8 in Fig 3) typically represent censored observations (cases not achieving the target outcome - there are several reasons this happens). In the Figure legend or in the Methods Section, the authors can consider mentioning what these marks on the survival trend signify.

(2) Figures 2-5. In figure grid the survival-key(s) can be removed since the figure legends clearly explain the variation of survival that the K-M trend describes.

(3) Page 9, line 9. Relapse-free median survival (insert 'median' before 'survival')

(4) Figure 3 and related text on page 9. The authors can mention the P-level from the comparison of survival trends of the two groups. The biggest difference seems to occur in the first 12 months and survival beyond 12 months looks similar for the two groups. If the two survival trends in Figure 3 are statistically compared, in the Methods Section the authors need to identify the method used for this analysis. Also, the method used to determine 95% confidence intervals for median survival can be clearly indicated in the Methods Section.

Level of interest: An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: Yes, and I have assessed the statistics in my report.

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests. John H. Kalbfleisch, Ph.D.