Reviewer's report

Title: Gastric emptying and small intestinal transit time and motility assessed by a magnet tracking system

Version: 2 Date: 7 October 2011

Reviewer: Werner Weitschies

Reviewer's report:

Major Compulsory Revisions

The revision gives clarification on the lacking information of the first version. However, the information provided by the authors raises questions on major aspects of their data interpretation and/or conclusions.

1) The "small" magnet was by no means small (6x15 mm, 1.6 g!). Such a large magnet will not pass the small intestine with the meal (as the authors agree in their revision). Accordingly, it is impossible to draw conclusion on postprandial small contraction frequencies or transit velocities. In the current version, this is still a major aspect of the manuscript.

2) The authors state in their revision that it is impossible to differentiate movements of the intestine from movements or the magnet inside the intestine by using MTS-1 data as performed by the authors. The reviewer agrees. But why do the author only comment on this without drawing the necessary consequences with respect to their data calculation and presentation? To the understanding of the reviewer one might argue, that the observed short bursts of transport are very likely to reflect intraluminal transport. However, calculations of mean transport velocities are impossible as long as a correct measure of the length of the small intestine is missing.

Level of interest: An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: Yes, but I do not feel adequately qualified to assess the statistics.

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests