Reviewer's report

Title: Comparative cost-efficiency of the EVOTECH Endoscope Cleaner and Reprocessor versus manual cleaning plus automated endoscope reprocessing in a real-world Canadian hospital endoscopy setting.

Version: 4 Date: 27 July 2011

Reviewer: Lawrence Muscarella

Reviewer's report:

July 27, 2011 (3rd review):

I. Discretionary revisions:

1. It is reasonable to request that the authors discuss and clarify for the reader whenever an implication or consequence of this manuscript’s results and conclusions in Canada does not similarly apply in the U.S.

II. Major compulsory revisions:

1. Although the manuscript addresses the Canadian marketplace, not the U.S.’s, this reviewer remains confused by the failure of this manuscript to include in such a cost comparison of two reprocessing devices an estimate of the initial acquisition prices of the EVOTECH ECR and Medivators DSD-201. This reviewer recommends adding a footnote to Table 7, like its other footnote, to clarify for the reader that this table does not include the initial acquisition price of either device. Otherwise, Table 7’s title – “Total per cycle and annual costs of labour plus consumables” – might be confusing.

Inclusion in the manuscript of this type of a footnote is important to ensure that this manuscript’s results do not feature a measurement bias that might skew its conclusions in favor of the EVOTECH ECR in comparison to the Medivators DSD-201. (Indeed, one of the manuscript’s authors is employed by Johnson and Johnson Medical Companies, a division of which manufactures and markets this Evotech device.)

III. Closing comments:

1. The revisions by the authors through this review process are appreciated and have contributed significantly to this manuscript’s improvement.

Level of interest: An article of importance in its field

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.
Declaration of competing interests:

I am employed by a U.S. manufacturer of automated endoscope reprocessing devices, such as the Evotech ECR and the Medivators DSD-201.