Reviewer's report

Title: Analysis of cell cycle-related proteins in gastric intramucosal differentiated-type cancers based on mucin phenotypes: a new concept of molecular carcinogenesis for early differentiated-type gastric cancers

Version: 1 Date: 22 November 2009

Reviewer: Byung Lee

Reviewer's report:

Major Compulsory Revisions
1. Results, page 9, paragraph 1: the explanation about male/female ratio is reversed. The description is the opposite of the data in Figure 2.
2. Discussion, paragraph 3, line 4: Is “Fig 5” mentioned in line 4 missing or does it mean “Fig 4”?

Minor Essential Revisions
1. Most pathologists understand the discrepancy of cancer criteria between Japan and Western countries. The cases shown in figure 1 and in figure 3 could be tubular adenomas in most of the Western pathologists. If those cases do not have lymph node metastasis as the authors believe, why those cases should be called “cancer” rather than “precancerous lesion” (especially those cases of low nuclear grade)?
2. Results, page 9, paragraph 2: Authors need to mention Figure 2 for the results of cdx2 immunohistochemistry.
3. Figure 2: Arrows pointing upward or downward needs to be explained.
   In addition, authors need to add the unit of the numbers by the vertical axis of Figure 2.
4. Figure legends, page 25; The explanation for figure 2 is unclear.
5. Figure 3: Authors are recommended to rearrange the labels (a-h) in the same location in each figure.

Level of interest: An article of limited interest

Quality of written English: Needs some language corrections before being published

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:
I declare that I have no competing interests.