Reviewer's report

Title: Autoantibodies to muscarinic acetylcholine receptors found in patients with primary biliary cirrhosis

Version: 2 Date: 19 August 2010

Reviewer: Nancy Agmon-Levin

Reviewer's report:

1. Is the question posed by the authors well defined? YES
2. Are the methods appropriate and well described? YES
3. Are the data sound? YES
4. Does the manuscript adhere to the relevant standards for reporting and data deposition? YES
5. Are the discussion and conclusions well balanced and adequately supported by the data? YES
6. Are limitations of the work clearly stated? YES
7. Do the authors clearly acknowledge any work upon which they are building, both published and unpublished? YES
8. Do the title and abstract accurately convey what has been found? YES
9. Is the writing acceptable? YES

- Minor Essential Revisions :

This is a nice manuscript on a plausible new association between hmAchR M3 specific antibodies and primary biliary cirrhosis.

Several comments:

1. The manuscript lack demographic (age, length of diagnosis etc), clinical, biochemical and serological association between those PBC seropositive to hmAchR M3 antibodies and those who are negative.

2. A more detailed discussion on the lack of clinical correlation between AMA (the major diagnostic marker) and PBC, as well as the need for new serological markers which may be of clinical importance is required (see recent manuscript A comprehensive evaluation of serum autoantibodies in primary biliary cirrhosis J Autoimmun. 2010 Feb;34(1):55-8.)