Reviewer's report

Title: New PRSS1 and common CFTR mutations in a child with acute recurrent pancreatitis, could be considered an "Hereditary" form of pancreatitis?

Version: 1 Date: 23 March 2010

Reviewer: LIU qi-cai

Reviewer's report:

Dear PhD, Tim Shipley,

I have reviewed the manuscript entitled "New PRSS1 and common CFTR mutations in a child with acute recurrent pancreatitis, could be considered an “Hereditary” form of pancreatitis ?" received at 7-March-2010.

For your guidance, my comments are appended below.

Undoubtedly#This paper proposes an extensive investigation of gene backgroud of pancreatitis in the boy. And the authors have collected much clinical data of the patients with chronic pancreatitis. As such, the matter is interesting, however the paper suffers for serious limits; we feel that it is unlikely to achieve an adequate priority for publication in BMC Genetic until they add some necessary data.

1)In order to strongly confirm the mutation of PRSS1 genes, direct sequencing is necessarily needed and the author should offer the figure to support his standpoint.

2)There is something wrong in localizate the number of basyl. It may be c.547 (p.S181G).

3)The methods in analysis the PRSS1, PRSS2, SPINK1, CTRC and CFTR gene must be given a few detail.

4)Selecting object is wrong. It must include the normal controls. This may not draw the correct conclusion(p.S181G mutation, is that a novel SNP?).

5)The author did not describe the forms of the p.S181G mutation, such as heterozygous mutation or homozygous mutation.

The variants of PRSS1 were checked http://www.unileipzig.de/pancreasmutation/db.html.

Many thanks

Qi-cai Liu

Level of interest: An article of importance in its field

Quality of written English: Acceptable
Statistical review: Yes, and I have assessed the statistics in my report.