Reviewer’s report

**Title:** Prostate-Specific Antigen Testing Accuracy in Community Practice

**Authors:**

Richard M Hoffman (rhoffman@unm.edu)
Frank D Gilliland (gillilan@hsc.usc.edu)
Meg Adams-Cameron (megadacam@aol.com)
Wiliam C Hunt (wchunt@nmtr.unm.edu)
Charles R Key (ckey@salud.unm.edu)

**Version:** 4 **Date:** 9 Sep 2002

**Reviewer:** Dr Curtis Mettlin

**Level of interest:** A paper of considerable general medical or scientific interest

**Advice on publication:** Accept after discretionary revisions

This a thorough and careful analysis of community data that reflect on the performance of PSA testing for early prostate cancer detection.

It provides a unique perspective that reflects more accurately on the public health impact and efficiency of PSA testing than the many previously reported clinical series.

The only methodological deficiency of concern to this reviewer is the apparent assumption that all of the PSA testing studied was done on a screening basis (independent of any other indication). Many PSA tests are done in the presence of urologic complaints and the performance of PSA testing differs in symptomatic vs asymptomatic patients. The investigators have no way of knowing the detailed circumstances in which the test was given and so may overstate the pertinence of these data to evaluation PSA testing as an independent screening test. There is little to do about this other than to include mention in the discussion.

**Competing interests:**

None declared.