Reviewer's report

Title: Comparative Effectiveness of Cognitive Behavioral Therapy for Insomnia: a Systematic Review

Version: 1 Date: 25 February 2012

Reviewer: Dieter Riemann

Reviewer's report:

This paper by Mitchell and colleagues deals with an important issue, i.e. the comparative effectiveness of CBT-I for insomnia. CBT-I is now considered as a major therapeutic avenue to treat insomnia - this paper in a meta-analytic fashion compares CBT-I to medications; data are included from direct comparison trials fulfilling certain well acknowledged inclusion and exclusion criteria. This, this paper deals with a clinically highly important issue.

Some minor queries:

1. For a better support of the insomnia-depression angle the authors may want to quote a recently published meta-analysis on the topic by Baglioni et al. 2011 (J Aff Dis).

2. A few sentences should be included about side-effects of CBT-I, e.g. sleepiness following sleep restriction. It cannot be taken for granted that CBT-I is without any relevant side-effects.

Level of interest: An article of importance in its field

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests