Reviewer's report

Title: Becoming a general practitioner? - Which factors have main impact on career choice of medical students

Version: 2 Date: 28 November 2010

Reviewer: Joe Rosenthal

Reviewer's report:

Becoming a general practitioner? – Which factors have main impact on career choice of medical students
**************************************************************************

Thank you for asking me to review this paper addressing factors influencing career choice of medical students at five German medical schools. It made interesting reading.

The topic is relevant to a medical education readership and the findings are important if not very surprising or new.

The introduction is pertinent though not very extensive in its review of existing literature in this area. It might have been helpful to provide clearer context by including more details of the historical, political and financial background to German healthcare provision as this may not be familiar to all readers. International comparisons would also have been relevant here since financial and social recognition of generalists versus specialists does vary from country to country and will influence career choice for future doctors.

The fact that only 1299 students out of a possible pool of 12,062 responded to the on-line survey is disappointing but nonetheless useful information was obtained, generating a worthwhile discussion. Its particular value I feel is to reinforce the need for all medical schools to recognise the need for greater attention to career advice for undergraduates from an early stage in their training.

In answer to your specific editorial questions:

1. The question posed by the authors is well defined
2. The methods are appropriate and well described.
3. The data appear sound.
4. The manuscript adheres to the relevant standards for reporting and data deposition.
5. The discussion and conclusions are well balanced and adequately supported by the data.
6. Limitations of the work are clearly stated.
7. The authors clearly acknowledge any work upon which they are building though could expand in this area

8. The title and abstract do accurately convey what has been found. I would however suggest slight re-working of the title as follows: Becoming a general practitioner – Which factors have most impact on career choice of medical students?

9. The writing is acceptable.

I would support the publication of this paper following some expansion of the introduction placing the work in a more international context.

**Level of interest:** An article of importance in its field

**Quality of written English:** Acceptable

**Statistical review:** No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

**Declaration of competing interests:**

'I declare that I have no competing interests'