Reviewer’s report

Title: Home visits - central to primary care, tradition or an obligation? A qualitative study

Version: 2 Date: 22 February 2011

Reviewer: George K Freeman

Reviewer’s report:

I’m virtually entirely satisfied with this revised version. And I entirely agree with Professor Pereira Gray when he says that home visits are seriously under-researched.

The one exception is the use of the word casern in table 3 column 2. The authors say they have discussed this with a native English speaker who says the translation from German Kaserne is acceptable. I strongly disagree! My English dictionary indeed lists the word, the origin is French (like so many military words) - more specifically Provencal and first noted in English in 1696. But this is a rare archaic word. For communicating understanding of what the German doctors said and presumably meant, the word ‘barracks’ is much better! And it is entirely in line with the negative views about nursing homes prevalent in table 3!

What a pity you could not find the book by Cartwright and Anderson! I have a copy myself and referred to it quite recently. Although arguably specific to Britain, it is a classic of its kind and of interest to GP researchers all over the developed world. As its title implies, it is an updated repeat of Ann Cartwright's original study in 1964 (Patients and their doctors. Routledge & Keagan Paul, London 1967). I do recommend that your library at least borrows one or both of these books.

So - substitute barracks for casern and I'm happy for immediate publication!

Level of interest: An article of importance in its field

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:

I have no competing interests