Author's response to reviews

Title: Does clinical examination aid in the diagnosis of urinary tract infections in women? A systematic review

Authors:

David Medina-Bombardó (dmedina@ibsalut.caib.es)
Antoni Jover-Palmer (ajover@ibsalut.caib.es)

Version: 5 Date: 25 May 2011

Author's response to reviews: see over
Cover letter mai 2011:

Dear Editor:

In this revision we incorporate all review’s comments:

**Reviewer: Guido Schmiemann suggestions:**
**Reviewer’s report:**
The article has improved considerably - shortcomings of the review are described clearly now.
I agree with the other reviewers on the lack of "quality analysis of included studies". As the inclusion and exclusion criteria were described quite clearly this is a minor revision in my point of view.

A quality analysis by QUADAS tool was now made and included its results in table 4 and comments in discussion section.

**Discretionary revisions**
The discussion should include a recently published metaanalysis in BMCFamPract on the same topic (Giessen et al 2010)

References and comments about Giessen study was now included.

**Reviewer: Malinee Laopaiboon**
**Reviewer’s report:**
The main concern is about ‘the quality assessment of each included study’. The authors mentioned that they accounted this in the papers inclusion but no any information can be reflected this issue. The authors only discussed about QUADAS, a tool for quality assessment, in the last paragraph of discussion, without any relation to their study.
They should use it for quality assessment in their systematic review. The discussion should be about any weak or strength points of the tools in relation to the potential assessment.

How we described above, a quality analysis was now included,

For table 2, I suggested to change heading of ‘intervention’ in column 4 to be ‘tests and reference’ rather than heading of column 5.
Even the authors moved a paragraph from discussion to be in the results, they should considered to remove the first sentence of that paragraph.

We are removed the sentence of the paragraph referred by the reviewer.

Sincerely:

David Medina-Bombardó
First author

Antoni J Jover-Palmer