Reviewer's report

Title: Primary Paediatric Care models and non-urgent Emergency Department utilization: An area-based cohort study

Version: 2 Date: 18 March 2010

Reviewer: K J Kelleher

Reviewer's report:

In general, the manuscript has many strengths. It is an interesting topic for health policy and scientists with interesting analytic questions even though it will not resonate with clinicians. Nevertheless, the authors were responsive to almost all of the criticisms from the previous version and have improved and clarified their purpose and methods a great deal. The only remaining item which was inadequately addressed was their perception of causation and lack of acknowledgment about confounding. Even though in their reply and manuscript they note they added a sentence late in the discussion to address this, the entire rest of the manuscript implies a causal relationship between practice structure and ed utilization beginning in the first line of the abstract even. rather than talking about 'impact' and 'effect' of the practice structure, they should be using association' language because it is likely there are marked confounds about who attends which practices.