Author’s response to reviews

Title: Primary Paediatric Care models and non-urgent Emergency Department utilization: An area-based cohort study

Authors:

Sara Farchi (farchi@asplazio.it)
Arianna Polo (polo@asplazio.it)
Francesco Franco (franco@asplazio.it)
Domenico Di Lallo (dilallo@asplazio.it)
Gabriella Guasticchi (guasticchi@asplazio.it)

Version: 3 Date: 23 March 2010

Author’s response to reviews: see over
Rome, 23 March 2010

Dear Editor,

We would like to submit the revised version of the manuscript entitled “Primary Pediatric Care models and non-urgent Emergency Department utilization: An area-based cohort study.” for your consideration for publication in BMC Family Practice

Please find below responses to the reviewer. We also added a sentence in the methods section where we explain why we have access to the data we used for this study.

Referee 2:
In general, the manuscript has many strengths. It is an interesting topic for health policy and scientists with interesting analytic questions even though it will not resonate with clinicians. Nevertheless, the authors were responsive to almost all of the criticisms from the previous version and have improved and clarified their purpose and methods a great deal. The only remaining item which was inadequately addressed was their perception of causation and lack of acknowledgment about confounding. Even though in their reply and manuscript they note they added a sentence late in the discussion to address this, the entire rest of the manuscript implies a causal relationship between practice structure and ed utilization beginning in the first line of the abstract even. rather than talking about 'impact' and 'effect' of the practice structure, they should be using association' language because it is likely there are marked confounds about who attends which practices.

Resp: We agree with the referee and we modified the paper according to his comment. We also added a sentence in the conclusion section highlighting an important criticism, the large use of ED care for non urgent conditions.

On behalf of the authors

Sara Farchi