Reviewer's report

Title: Extreme Verification Bias in Paired Continuous Tests Can Cause Researchers to Choose the Wrong Screening Modality

Version: 1 Date: 28 July 2008

Reviewer: Corne Biesheuvel

Reviewer's report:

The authors describe the potential occurrence of paired extreme verification bias when comparing two screening modalities and use a hypothetical example to illustrate their case and I find they do a very good job. The only comment I have is that it would be extremely helpful for the reader if the authors provide an extra figure that explains this phenomenon. I suggest something like figure 1 in the paper 'Case-control and two-gate designs in diagnostic accuracy studies' by Rutjes AW, Reitsma JB, Vandenbroucke JP, Glas AS, Bossuyt PM. Clin Chem. 2005 Aug;51(8):1335-41 or figure 2 in the paper 'Randomised comparisons of medical tests: sometimes invalid, not always efficient' by Bossuyt PM, Lijmer JG, Mol BW. Lancet. 2000 Nov 25;356(9244):1844-7.

Level of interest: An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests