Reviewer's report

Title: Do intrauterine or genetic influences explain the foetal origins of chronic disease? A novel experimental method for disentangling effects.

Version: 2 Date: 14 May 2007

Reviewer: Alan Taylor

Reviewer's report:

General

The authors have substantially revised their manuscript following review. This has made the paper much clearer and has added useful detail on the practicality and utility of the proposed research design. It will be interesting to see future results from this research. I now consider the paper acceptable for publication in BMC Medical Research Methodology.

Major Compulsory Revisions (that the author must respond to before a decision on publication can be reached)

Minor Essential Revisions (such as missing labels on figures, or the wrong use of a term, which the author can be trusted to correct)

Discretionary Revisions (which the author can choose to ignore)

- Not sure why the authors report a kappa of .17 for alcohol use given they state it was "not consistently recorded" - which implies to me that it should not be used anyway - as it won't be available for a large section of the sample - even if reports agreed with the antenatal notes I would not necessarily trust this data as collected - from either source.

Which journal?: Not appropriate for BMC Medicine: an article whose findings are important to those with closely related interests and more suited to BMC Medical Research Methodology

What next?: Offer publication in BMC Medical Research Methodology after discretionary revisions

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No