Reviewer’s report

Title: Empirical Comparison of Linear, Logistic, and CART Models for Binary Classification of Dyslipidemia from Anthropometric Measurements

Version: 1 Date: 17 January 2004

Reviewer: Stefan s Ma

Reviewer’s report:

This is a well-written paper. The objectives of the paper are 1) to improve on previous statistical strategies for detecting dyslipidemia in the general population; and 2) to compare the performance of four statistical modeling approaches. The study was able to achieve these objectives supported by the empirical findings. However, since the performance of the four modeling approaches are very similar using empirical data, in terms classification performance criteria, i.e. sensitivity, specificity and both positive and negative predictive values, one lay person’s concern is that what is the recommendation of choosing which modeling approach if they really like to apply it in their own setting. The question is that “is there a need to supplement the comparison by simulation study?” because we can simulate data for various situation in which the empirical data do not have.

What next?: Accept without revision

Level of interest: An article of limited interest

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No

Declaration of competing interests:

none.