Reviewer's report

Title: Undergraduate medical education in emergency medical care: A nationwide survey AT German medical schools.

Version: 2 Date: 25 November 2008

Reviewer: Andrew Lockey

Reviewer's report:

This is an excellent piece of work providing a very comprehensive survey of current practice of Emergency Medicical Care teaching in German Medical Schools. The question is well defined and the data obtained from the questionnaire study is of high relevance. In addition, the quality of the writing is excellent.

I feel that the paper can be further strengthened as follows:

1) The paper clearly describes the results of a survey. I am interested, however, in what the authors recommend for the future of Emergency Medical Care training in Germany. They have obviously highlighted some limitations with the current system but, apart from a very brief conclusion, they do not state how they feel the system should change. This is a weakness of the paper as it stands. [MAJOR]

2) What was the reason for the 3 non-respondants? [MINOR]

3) In the section regarding Instructor Qualification, it is noted that teaching tends to be carried out by senior members of staff. Is this adequate qualification to be a good teacher? Some comment would be useful about this [MINOR]

4) Much is made of the interdisciplinary input to teaching. Is this a weakness as well as a strength? Other countries (most notably UK and USA) have developed Emergency Medicine as a separate specialty. Might this be a future development for Germany (the discussion of this could tie in with point (1) above)? [MAJOR]

Level of interest: An article of importance in its field

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests