Author's response to reviews

Title: Prehospital score for acute disease: a community-based observational study in Japan

Authors:

Yasuhiro Toyoda (ytoyoda@pbhel.med.osaka-u.ac.jp)
Yoshio Matsuo (kch-25_q9q9@kch.city.kishiwada.osaka.jp)
Hiroyuki Tanaka (ertanaka@tokyo-med.ac.jp)
Hidekazu Fujiwara (kishiwada-kyukyu@tvk.zaq.ne.jp)
Toshio Takatorige (takatorige@pnhel.med.osaka-u.ac.jp)
Hiroyasu Iso (iso@pbhel.med.osaka-u.ac.jp)

Version: 5 Date: 4 October 2007

Author's response to reviews:

04 Oct. 2007

Iratxe Puebla
Senior Assistant Editor
BMC-series journals

Dear Editor

We would like to thank you for the provisional acceptance for our manuscript. We revised the manuscript based on the reviewer's comments. In the following pages, we provide a point-by-point response. According to your request, we used Manuscript Presentation Service (http://www.biomedes.co.uk/) for a native check. Thank you for your recommendation.

Sincerely,

Professor Hiroyasu Iso, MD
Public Health, Department of Social and Environmental Medicine, Graduate School of Medicine, Osaka University, Yamadaoka Suita-shi, Osaka 565-0871, Japan.

Phone: +81 (6) 6879-3911 Fax: +81 (6) 6879-3919
E-mail: iso@pbhel.med.osaka-u.ac.jp

Homer Tien
Minor Essential Revisions (such as missing labels on figures, or the wrong use of a term, which the author can be trusted to correct)

1) The Background has too much confusing information. For example: "78% ambulances staffed with emergency life-saving technicians", "the proportion of emergency personnel with the license of emergency life-saving technician is only 30%" and "the proportion of ambulances staffed by emergency life-saving technician in 16 prefectures with metropolitan is still < 70%". Please pick one item that illustrates the point that emergency life-saving technicians do not staff all ambulances.

¿We picked up one sentence: "78% ambulances staffed with emergency life-saving technicians".

2) As well, you already say that the study is perhaps not generalizable as Kishiwada City is different than the rest of the nation because of the lower proportion of hospitalizations. You need to also add that another reason it may not be generalizable is that you were able to obtain a complete data set in 91% of cases in Kishiwada city. However, in your background, you mention that only 25% of patients have their systolic bp taken and 27% have their oxygen sat taken. Therefore, unless there is some major reform amongst emergency life-saving or medical technicians, this triage tool will not be useful outside of Kishiwada city.

¿We added another reason according to your suggestion.

Daniel P Davis

Discretionary Revisions (which the author can choose to ignore)

1) I would recommend that someone fluent in English review the prose to assure grammatical correctness.

¿Our manuscript was copyedited by `Manuscript Presentation Service (http://www.biomedes.co.uk/)` .