Reviewer’s report

Title: Management of acute renal colic in the UK: A questionnaire survey

Version: 3 Date: 9 November 2004

Reviewer: Maryse Lapeyre-Mestre

Reviewer’s report:

General
The authors answered almost all questions about background, methods, and results of the study. I just have a question about statistical analysis, because I have some experience in clinical research methodology, but I am not a statistician.

The description of the statistical method part is more clear and understandable. I thank the authors for informing me that Fisher exact test could be applicable to analyse tables larger than 2 by 2. Actually, I'm not highly efficient in statistics, and my knowledge remains old-fashioned and classical. However, I believe that many readers are like me, thus it is necessary to indicate which statistical software has been used to perform the analysis. This is the same problem with validity of Chi-squared test, in almost statistical softwares, the Chi-squared is usually invalid when a value (expected and not observed, as in the table 2 for the comparison of USS) in one cell is less than 5.

Major Compulsory Revisions (that the author must respond to before a decision on publication can be reached)

Minor Essential Revisions (such as missing labels on figures, or the wrong use of a term, which the author can be trusted to correct)

Discretionary Revisions (which the author can choose to ignore)

The description of the statistical method part is more clear and understandable. However, I persist to think that an abbreviation of KW for Kruskall-wallis test should be more appropriate (and less confusing in the table) than X2, even if the KW test follows a X2 distribution.

The statistical references cited in the letter could be included in the manuscript.

What next?: Accept after discretionary revisions

Level of interest: An article of importance in its field

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: Yes

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests.