Reviewer’s report

Title: Treatment of hepatic encephalopathy by on-line hemodiafiltration: A case series study

Version: 3 Date: 23 March 2010

Reviewer: Norman Sussman

Reviewer’s report:

MINOR ESSENTIAL REVISIONS

1. I do not disagree with the diagnosis of ALF in patient 11, but I don’t believe that this was alcohol-induced. How can you be so certain that he did not take an overdose of acetaminophen – APAP would have been undetectable by the time of admission. Did you confirm with APAP adducts? If not, please acknowledge the possibility of another insult to the liver.

2. Please update your reference list to include recent work in artificial liver.

3. I don't think ref 23 is the final word on hepatic encephalopathy. You may want to include other references or state that this is one theory.

4. Please add a footnote to Table 1 that some patients had a higher AST at some time during their illness, and that the value in the Table reflects the value at the start of treatment.

Level of interest: An article of limited interest

Quality of written English: Needs some language corrections before being published

Statistical review: Yes, but I do not feel adequately qualified to assess the statistics.

Declaration of competing interests:

Unchanged from my initial review